



BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

MEETING OF THE SCRUTINY BOARD

THURSDAY 25TH FEBRUARY 2010, AT 6.00 P.M.

COMMITTEE ROOM, THE COUNCIL HOUSE, BURCOT LANE, BROMSGROVE

MEMBERS: Councillors D. L. Pardoe (Chairman), C. B. Taylor (Vice-Chairman),
A. N. Blagg, R. J. Deeming, S. R. Peters, C. R. Scurrall and
C. J. Tidmarsh

AGENDA

1. To receive apologies for absence
2. Declarations of Interest and whipping arrangements
3. To confirm the accuracy of the minutes of the meetings of the Scrutiny Board held on 19th and 26th January 2010 (Pages 1 - 6)
4. Presentation on Meeting the Challenges of Climate Change
5. Scrutiny Proposal -Annual Bonfire Event (Councillor J. Duddy) (Pages 7 - 12)
6. Verbal update on progress of the Improving Residents' Satisfaction Task Group (Task Group Chairman: Councillor S. R. Colella)
7. Work Programme (Pages 13 - 14)
8. To consider any other business, details of which have been notified to the Head of Legal, Equalities and Democratic Services prior to the commencement of the meeting and which the Chairman considers to be of so urgent a nature it cannot wait until the next meeting.

K. DICKS
Chief Executive

The Council House
Burcot Lane
BROMSGROVE
Worcestershire
B60 1AA

16th February 2010

Agenda Item 3

BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

MEETING OF THE SCRUTINY BOARD

TUESDAY, 19TH JANUARY 2010 AT 4.00 P.M.

PRESENT: Councillors D. L. Pardoe (Chairman), C. B. Taylor (Vice-Chairman),
S. R. Peters, C. R. Scurrall and C. J. Tidmarsh

Observers: Councillor P. M. McDonald and Councillor Mrs. C. M.
McDonald

Officers: Mr. H. Bennett, Mrs. S. Sellers, Mr. M. Carr and Ms. A. Scarce

50/09 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors A. N. Blagg and R. J. Deeming.

51/09 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST AND WHIPPING ARRANGEMENTS

No declarations of interest or whipping arrangements were received at the start of the meeting. During the meeting Councillor C. R. Scurrall declared a personal interest in the Call-in – Local Neighbourhood Partnerships (Minute No 52/09 refers) as a parish councillor for Belbroughton Parish Council.

52/09 CONSIDERATION OF CALL-IN - LOCAL NEIGHBOURHOOD PARTNERSHIPS

Councillor P. M. McDonald requested that it be noted in the Minutes that he was unhappy with the 4.00 p.m. start time of the meeting.

The Board's attention was drawn to the decision taken by the Cabinet on 2nd December 2009 in relation to Local Neighbourhood Partnerships (LNPs), namely:

- (a) all Local Neighbourhood Partnerships (LNPs) be closed as at 31st March 2010;
- (b) that it be noted that the closure will produce a revenue saving of £90,000 in 2010/11 and £120,000 in 2011/2012;
- (c) it be noted that the continued expansion of the LNPs would have resulted in a saving of £150,000 in 2012/2013 if the LNPs had continued to expand at a cost of £30,000 per annum (the existing Medium Term Financial Plan runs until 2011/2012);
- (d) the Charford LNP be closed with immediate effect and the resulting 2009/10 revenue saving of £10,000 be direct to the Trunk;

- (e) £25,000 of the annual revenue saving for 2010/11, 2011/12 and 2012/13 be used to fund the shortfall in the Medium Term Financial Plan.

The Council's Scrutiny Procedure Rules provided that the Chief Executive should call in a decision for scrutiny by the Board if so requested by the Chairman of the Scrutiny Board, any three Members of the Scrutiny Board or any five Members of the Council who were not Members of the Cabinet. The call-in would be considered by the Scrutiny Board at either the next scheduled meeting of the Scrutiny Board, or a special meeting of the Scrutiny Board to be convened by the Chief Executive within 10 working days of receipt of the request to call-in, or such other date as agreed by the Chief Executive in consultation with the author of the call-in and the Chairman of the Scrutiny Board. Such a request had been submitted by five Members of the Council who were not Members of the Cabinet on 9th December 2009, and accordingly, Members were requested to consider the call-in request. A report on the matter was submitted for consideration.

The Chairman invited Councillor P. M. McDonald to address the Board as to the reasons why he and the other four Members, Councillors Mrs. C. M. McDonald, E. J. Murray, S. P. Shannon and C. J. K. Wilson, had requested that the decision be called in.

The Board then heard from the Assistant Chief Executive who had prepared the report to the Board and who had also been the author of the report to Cabinet from which the call-in had arisen. The Board had expected the attendance of Councillor R. Hollingworth, the Executive Member with responsibility for LNPs. However, he had been unavoidably delayed following an earlier meeting and was not able to attend.

The Board Members asked a number of questions and discussed the issues relating to the decision to close the LNPs including consideration of the following areas:

- the Council's duty to consult
- the implications of the closure with reference to the Budget and Policy Framework Procedure Rules and the Medium Term Financial Plan
- the merits and financial implications of Local Neighbourhood Partnerships
- the decision making process and options available to Cabinet

During the ensuing discussions Members raised a number of questions to which officers responded, whereupon it was

RESOLVED that the call-in be dismissed.

The meeting closed at 4.50 p.m.

Chairman

BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

MEETING OF THE SCRUTINY BOARD

TUESDAY, 26TH JANUARY 2010 AT 6.00 P.M.

PRESENT: Councillors D. L. Pardoe (Chairman), A. N. Blagg, R. J. Deeming,
C. R. Scurrall and C. J. Tidmarsh

Officers: Ms. J. Pickering, Mrs. S. Sellers, Mr. M. Carr and Ms. A. Scarce

54/09 **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors S. R. Peters and C. B. Taylor.

55/09 **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST AND WHIPPING ARRANGEMENTS**

No declarations of interest or whipping arrangements were received.

56/09 **MINUTES**

The minutes of the meeting of the Scrutiny Board held on 24th November 2009 were submitted.

RESOLVED that the minutes be approved as a correct record.

57/09 **QUARTERLY SCRUTINY RECOMMENDATION TRACKER**

The Head of Financial Services asked Members to be aware that due to the new appointments of Heads of Service, the Head of Street Scene and Community was unable to attend the meeting. It was hoped that the new Head of Environmental Services would be in a position to take up some of his role over the next few weeks and the Head of Financial Services asked Members to bear with them during this transitional period.

The Board considered the updated Recommendation Tracker and although they appreciated the current situation, shared their concerns that several items in respect of the Refuse and Recycling Scrutiny Investigation continued to be outstanding after some 18 months, and in particular the item referring to NVQ training for all refuse and recycling staff. Members were reminded of information previously provided by the Head of Street Scene and Community advising that this was due to commence in January 2010. Members commented that the refuse and recycling staff had performed very well during the recent severe weather conditions and it was agreed that a letter of thanks should be sent, from the Board, to the relevant Head of Service, congratulating them on their hard work during this difficult period.

After discussion, the Board asked that the new Head of Environmental Services be invited to the Scrutiny Board meeting to be held on 23rd March 2010.

Members agreed that it would be useful in future to have the following information in respect of items on the Recommendation Tracker:

- Has the recommendation been implemented?
- If not why not and when is it expected to be implemented?
- What outcomes have been achieved as a result of the recommendations?

Members were reminded that the Refuse and Recycling (including Value for Money) Task Group would be reconvened in July 2010 to formally review the progress made.

RESOLVED that the new Head of Environmental Services be invited to the Scrutiny Board meeting to be held on 23rd March 2010.

58/09 **RESPONSE FROM CABINET ON HOT FOOD TAKEAWAYS**

The Board were advised that at the Cabinet meeting on 2nd December 2009 consideration had been given to the Scrutiny Board's report on Hot Food Takeaways and it was confirmed that all recommendations had been approved by Cabinet.

Members were pleased with this outcome and officers confirmed that these recommendations would now be included within the Quarterly Recommendation Tracker, in order to monitor their implementation.

Some Members expressed their concerns over what priority would be given to the implementation of these recommendations and it was agreed that the relevant Head of Service would be asked for an estimate of when each recommendation would be implemented and when the Supplementary Planning document would be in place.

RESOLVED that the Hot Food Takeaways Report be included in the Quarterly Recommendation Tracker.

59/09 **VERBAL UPDATE ON PROGRESS OF THE IMPROVING RESIDENTS' SATISFACTION TASK GROUP**

The Chairman thanked Councillor S. R. Colella, Chairman of the Task Group for attending the meeting and asked him to give a brief update on the progress of the Improving Residents' Satisfaction Task Group.

Councillor Colella explained that the first meeting had, unfortunately, been cancelled due to the exceptional weather conditions, but that the Task Group still anticipated being able to receive the first draft report on 31st March 2010. Councillor Colella then gave a brief outline of the areas they hoped to cover at the four meetings that had been arranged:

- A detailed analysis of the Place Survey and comparatives with other Councils.
- Theory and best practice on satisfaction, including review of communication strategies and comparison with those of excellent authorities (Selby and Wychavon).
- Local Practice and local issues

Witnesses to be invited to meetings were:

- Fiona Narburgh - Head of Strategy and Communications (Wychavon District Council)
- Peter John (Newsquest)
- Relevant Portfolio Holders with relevant officers
- PACT Chairman
- A Parish Council representative

The Board held a general discussion around the public's perception of how Council business is conducted, unpopular decisions that the Council has to make, residents' perception of the services provided and the use of various forums and groups to get the Council's message across.

60/09 **MEETING THE CHALLENGES OF CLIMATE CHANGE**

The Board considered the report on Meeting the Challenge of Climate Change. Members were advised that at the Council meeting on 20th January 2010 a motion had been passed in respect of the Council signing up to the 10-10 Reduction of CO2 emissions and that this matter was referred to the Scrutiny Board to be considered as part of its investigation into Climate Change.

Members were concerned that the commitment to the 10-10 Reduction of CO2 emissions had a strict timescale and after discussion it was agreed that further information on this would be requested from the Climate Change Officer when attending the Scrutiny Board meeting on 25th February 2010. As the motion referred to had been put forward by Councillor S. P. Shannon, it was suggested that it would be appropriate for Councillor Shannon to be invited to attend the Scrutiny Board meeting on 25th February 2010.

A Member of the Board had already attended the training "Climate Change Condensed" and advised that it had been most informative and encouraged Members to attend.

RESOLVED:

- (a) that the Board receive a presentation on Climate Change Mitigation at the meeting to be held on 25th February 2010;
- (b) that the 10-10 Reduction in CO2 Emissions be included within the Climate Change Investigation;
- (c) that Members endeavour to attend the Modern Councillor Programme Event "Climate Change Condensed" on 16th February 2010; and
- (d) that Councillor S. P. Shannon be invited to attend the Scrutiny Board Meeting on 25th February 2010.

61/09 **WORK PROGRAMME**

The Board discussed the topics on the Work Programme in detail and shared their concerns that several of these would need to be picked up by the new Executive Director or new Heads of Service, which may result in a delay in them being dealt with. Members were also advised that the quarterly meeting between the Leader and Chairman of the Scrutiny Board would take place shortly.

The Board were advised that it was important that the topics were programmed into future meetings and that it may be useful to invite other relevant bodies to meetings to add value to the investigation. Discussion then followed on the Arts and Events Strategy 2010/11, the Corporate Safeguarding Policy (Children and Vulnerable Adults) and Anti-social Drinking & Alcohol Admissions to Hospitals.

The Senior Solicitor advised that in respect of the topic Street Trading Consent Policy, which had been included in the Work Programme at the request of Members following the meeting on 24th November 2009, this Policy had been approved at the full Council meeting held on 20th January 2010. As the Council had agreed that the Scrutiny Board should investigate this topic after a "settling in" period, it would therefore be included in the Work Programme for the year 2010/11.

RESOLVED:

- (a) that the Corporate Safeguarding Policy (Children and Vulnerable Adults) be considered at the Scrutiny Board meeting to be held on 23rd March 2010.
- (b) that the topic Anti-social Drinking and Alcohol Admissions to Hospitals be considered at the Scrutiny Board meeting to be held on 22nd April 2010 and a representative from the PCT be invited to attend.

The meeting closed at 6.50 p.m.

Chairman

BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

SCRUTINY BOARD

25TH FEBRUARY 2010

SCRUTINY INVESTIGATION PROPOSAL

Responsible Portfolio Holder	Cllr Roger Smith – Portfolio Holder for Youth, Sports, Recreation and Culture
Responsible Head of Service For Overview & Scrutiny	Mr. John Godwin - Acting Head of Culture and Community Services

1. SUMMARY

- 1.1 An Overview and Scrutiny Proposal Form relating to the loss made by the annual Bonfire/Firework Display in November 2008 and November 2009, has been completed by Councillor J. Duddy which the Board needs to consider.

2. RECOMMENDATION

- 2.1 That the Board considers the completed proposal form (at Appendix 1), and agrees to one of the following:
- (a) that the topic is included on the work programme and the Board undertakes the investigation;
 - (b) that the topic is included on the work programme and a Task Group is established to undertake a more in-depth investigation (if this option is agreed, membership forms would be sent out to all non-Cabinet Members and completed forms, along with a completed overview and scrutiny exercise scoping checklist would be considered at the next meeting);
 - (c) that further information be requested from a relevant source before deciding whether or not further investigation is required; or
 - (d) decides to take no further action.

3. BACKGROUND

- 3.1 An Overview and Scrutiny Proposal Form relating to the loss made by the Annual Bonfire/Firework Display in November 2008 and November 2009, submitted by Councillor J. Duddy is attached at Appendix 1 for the Board to consider and discuss.
- 3.2 If the Board decides that it does wish to investigate this topic further, it then needs to decide whether it is appropriate for the Board itself to undertake the investigation or whether a more in-depth investigation is required and a task group would be established.

3.3 Another option is for the Board to request further information on the topic from a relevant source to assist Members to decide whether an investigation is required.

3.4 Alternatively, the Board could decide that it is not a topic it wishes to investigate, in which case no further action would be required.

4. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

4 There are no financial implications directly relating to this report, however, if the proposal is accepted, any implications would be considered as part of any subsequent investigation undertaken.

5. LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

5.1 There are no legal implications directly relating to this report, however, if the proposal is accepted, any implications would be considered as part of any subsequent investigation undertaken.

6. COUNCIL OBJECTIVES

6.1 This report does not directly link to the Council Objectives, however, information on how the topic links to the Council Objectives and Priorities is included on the proposal form at Appendix 1.

7. RISK MANAGEMENT INCLUDING HEALTH & SAFETY CONSIDERATIONS

There are no risk management issues directly relating to this report, however, if the proposal is accepted, any implications would be considered as part of any subsequent investigation undertaken.

8. CUSTOMER IMPLICATIONS

8.1 There are no customer implications directly relating to this report, however, if the proposal is accepted, any implications would be considered as part of any subsequent investigation undertaken.

9. EQUALITIES AND DIVERSITY IMPLICATIONS

9.1 There are no implications directly relating to this report for the Council's Equalities and Diversity Policies, however, if the proposal is accepted, any implications would be considered as part of any subsequent investigation undertaken.

10. VALUE FOR MONEY IMPLICATIONS

10.1 There are no value for money implications directly relating to this report, however, if the proposal is accepted, any implications would be considered as part of any subsequent investigation undertaken.

11. CLIMATE CHANGE AND CARBON IMPLICATIONS

11.1 There are no climate change and carbon implications directly relating to this report, however, if the proposal is accepted, any implications would be considered as part of any subsequent investigation undertaken.

12. OTHER IMPLICATIONS

Procurement Issues - None
Personnel - None
Governance/Performance Management - None
Community Safety including Section 17 of Crime and Disorder Act 1998 - None
Policy - None
Biodiversity - None

13. OTHERS CONSULTED ON THE REPORT

Portfolio Holder	No
Chief Executive	No
Executive Director - Partnerships and Projects	No
Executive Director - Services	No
Assistant Chief Executive	Yes
Head of Service	Yes
Head of Financial Services	No
Head of Legal, Equalities & Democratic Services	Yes

Head of Organisational Development & HR	No
Corporate Procurement Team	

14. WARDS AFFECTED

All Wards.

15. APPENDICES

Appendix 1 Overview and Scrutiny Proposal Form

16. BACKGROUND PAPERS

None.

CONTACT OFFICER

Name: Michael Carr
E Mail: m.carr@bromsgrove.gov.uk
Tel: (01527) 881407

OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY - PROPOSAL FORM

Name of Councillor:	JAMES DUDDY
Topic:	FIREWORKS
Specific subject areas to be investigated:	INCOME / EXPENDITURE
Reasons why this subject should be considered:	MADE A LOSS OF £13852 IN NOV 09 AND A LOSS OF £23459 IN NOV 08
Evidence to support the need for this particular investigation:	THE FIGURES / SPREAD SHEETS HAVE ALREADY BEEN SUPPLIED
Council priorities it links to:	VALUE FOR MONEY
Possible key outcomes: (i.e. what do you anticipate could be achieved?)	TO AT LEAST BREAK EVEN OR MAKE A PROFIT.

Please indicate if any of the following apply to the proposed subject area:

Poorly performing service	YES IN TERMS OF GENERATING INCOME	✓
An area of concern identified by internal or external audit process		
Identified as a key issue in the Sustainable Community Strategy		
Contributes to the aims of the Council Plan		?
Key interest to the public (e.g. low levels of satisfaction with the service/featured in local media)	PUBLIC ARE AWARE	✓
It affects more than three wards within the District		✓
It affects Bromsgrove District and one or more areas outside the District		✓
High level of budgetary commitment		✓
Pattern of overspending or underspending		✓
Contributes to priority area of central government		
Proposed new policy for the Council		?

PEOPLE ATTEND FROM SURROUNDING AREAS

Please return completed forms to: Scrutiny Officer, Committee Section, Legal, Equalities and Democratic Services, Bromsgrove District Council

This page is intentionally left blank

Agenda Item 7

SCRUTINY BOARD

WORK PROGRAMME

25TH FEBRUARY 2010

This Work Programme consists of two sections: Items for future meetings (including updates) and Task Group Reviews.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

(a) To consider and agree the work programme and update it accordingly.

ITEMS FOR FUTURE MEETINGS (INCLUDING UPDATES)

Subject	Date of Consideration	Other Information
Recommendation Tracker <i>- Permanent Item -</i>	22nd April 2010	A quarterly report monitoring the implementation of scrutiny recommendations. The next tracker report is due to be considered by the Board on 26th January 2010.
Improving Residents' Satisfaction Task Group	25th February 2010 (to be included at each meeting until completion)	Update on investigations so far.
Report from the quarterly meeting between the Leader and Chairman of Scrutiny Board <i>-Permanent Item –</i>	22nd April 2010	Verbal update on discussion between Chairman of the Scrutiny Board and the Leader due to be considered by the Board.
Meeting the Challenges of Climate Change	25th February 2010	Presentation by Climate Change Officer
The Arts and Events Strategy 2010/11	23rd March 2010	Huw Mosely - Arts Development and Events Officer Andy Woods – Director, Artrix
Call-In Procedure Review	22nd April 2010	It states in the Constitution that the provisions relating to call-in and urgency should be monitored annually. Therefore, the Scrutiny Board will need to review the process to ensure it is fit for purpose.
The Corporate Safeguarding Policy	22nd April 2010	

(Children and Vulnerable Adults)		
Economic Regeneration Policy	Deferred to 2010-2011	
Engaging with Young People in Bromsgrove	Deferred to 2010-2011	Members to identify evidence to be considered for this item.
Anti-social Drinking & Alcohol Admissions to Hospitals	22nd April 2010	Members to identify evidence to be considered for this item. Liz Altay – PCT (TBC)
Street Trading Consent Policy	To be included in Work Programme 2010/11 This topic could be referred to the Overview Board as part of its review of planning and licensing policy.	Identified as a future item to be included in the Scrutiny Board Work Programme at the Scrutiny Board Meeting held on 24th November 2009.

SCRUTINY TASK GROUP REVIEWS

Task Group	Date of Review (when Task Group is due to reconvene)
Refuse and Recycling (including VFM)	July 2010

Future Scrutiny Board Meeting Dates:

23rd March 2010

22nd April 2010 (Thursday)